

Web Site

---

## WEB SITE

Visit our WEB SITE  
at  
<http://www.khpplc.co.uk>



Key Haven Publications LTD  
PO Box 669; Oxford OX3 3AU  
Telephone +44 (0) 1865 352121; Facsimile +44 (0) 1865 351081

# THE CHARITY LAW & PRACTICE REVIEW

---

## C L & P R

Volume 16, 2013-14

### EDITORIAL BOARD

**Robert Venables QC, MA (Oxon), LLM (London)**  
(Taxation Editor)  
**Debra Morris, (Managing Editor)**

### CONSULTING EDITORIAL BOARD

**The Right Honourable Lord Hoffmann**  
**The Right Honourable Lord Justice Mummery**

*For details of the  
Advisory Editorial Board please refer over*

All editorial correspondence should be addressed to:

**Debra Morris**  
Director  
Charity Law & Policy Unit  
The Liverpool Law School  
University of Liverpool  
Liverpool L69 7ZS  
England  
Tel: + 44 151 794 2825  
E-mail: [Debra.Morris@liverpool.ac.uk](mailto:Debra.Morris@liverpool.ac.uk)

**The Charity Law & Practice Review**  
is published by  
Key Haven Publications LTD  
PO Box 669; Oxford OX3 3AU  
Telephone +44 (0) 1865 352121; Facsimile +44 (0) 1865 351081  
*E- Mail address: [aw.khpplc@khpplc.co.uk](mailto:aw.khpplc@khpplc.co.uk)*

# DISCLAIMER

The views contained herein are put forward for further consideration only and are not to be acted upon without independent and professional advice.

Neither the Publisher nor the Authors or Contributors can accept any responsibility for any loss occasioned to any person no matter howsoever caused or arising as a result of or in consequence of action taken or refrained from in reliance on the contents hereof.

©2014 KEY HAVEN PUBLICATION LTD

The moral rights of the authors have been asserted.

### **Conditions of Sale**

All rights strictly reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without prior written permission of the publisher.

Any person infringing the publisher's copyright will be liable to criminal and/or civil proceedings.

Papers are invited for publication on the understanding that they contain original unpublished material not submitted to any other journal and may be subject to anonymous peer review. The decision of the Managing Editors to accept, reject or modify any paper shall be final. Style sheets are available from the publisher on request.

# THE ADVISORY EDITORIAL BOARD

---

***Robert Venables QC***

Chairman of Advisory Editorial Board

***Lord Phillips of Sudbury***

Solicitor and Consultant, Bates Wells & Braithwaite

***Christopher McCall QC***

Formerly Junior Counsel to the Attorney General in Charity Matters

***Professor Gareth Jones QC LLD***

Trinity College, Cambridge

***Lee Sheridan LLD***

Formerly Professor of Law University College, Cardiff

***James Kessler QC***

Barrister

***Hubert Picarda QC***

Barrister and Founder Editor of the Review

***Adrian Longley OBE***

Solicitor, Arlingtons Sharmas

***Professor Peter Luxton***

Professor of Law, Cardiff University

***Professor Jean Warbuton***

Charity Law Unit, Liverpool Law School, University of Liverpool

***Elizabeth Cairns***

Solicitor

***Jennie Gubbins***

Solicitor and Partner, Trowers & Hamlin  
(Charitable Housing Associations)

***Robert Meakin***

Solicitor and Partner, Stone King Sewell

***Peter Smith***

Lecturer in Law, University of Exeter  
(Universities & Ecclesiastical Charities)

***Robert Venables***

Consultant, Bircham Dyson Bell

Visiting Professor of Charity Law, London South Bank University  
formerly Legal Charity Commissioner

# OVERSEAS CORRESPONDENTS

---

## AUSTRALIA

*Professor Myles McGregor-Lowndes*

Director, Centre of Philanthropy and Nonprofit Studies, Faculty of Business,  
Queensland University of Technology, Brisbane

*Professor Gino Dal Pont*

Professor of Law, Faculty of Law, University of Tasmania

## CANADA

*E Blake Bromley*

Founder and President, Benefic Group, Vancouver

## SOUTH AFRICA

*Richard Rosenthal*

Director, Richard Rosenthal Consultancy, Cape Town

## USA

*Professor Robert Atkinson*

Professor of Law, Florida State University

*Professor Harvey Dale*

Director, National Center on Philanthropy and the Law, New York University

*Professor Karla W Simon*

Chair, International Center for Civil Society Law  
Professor of Law, Catholic University of America

## CONTENTS

<b>Introduction</b>	vii
<i>The Commissioners for Special Purposes of the Income Tax v Pemsel</i> Sir John Mummery	1
<i>Re Macduff and the Charity of the Wise</i> Jonathan Garton	21
<i>Dingle v Turner Forty Years On</i> Peter Luxton	43
<i>Moggridge v Thackwell: Defining The Nature of the Courts’ Scheme-Making Power</i> John Picton	59
<i>Camille and Henry Dreyfus Foundation Inc v Inland Revenue Commissioners</i> Robert Meakin	73
<i>Thornton v Howe: A Sound Principle or a Seminal Case past its best buy date?</i> Hubert Picarda QC	85
<i>McGovern v Attorney-General</i> Alison Dunn	105
<i>R (Weaver) v London and Quadrant Housing Trust</i> Ian Alderson	129
<b>Applications to the First-Tier Tribunal (Charity) by ‘Persons Affected’ by the Charity Commission’s Decision</b> Alison Mckenna	147
<b>A State of Flux in Public Benefit across the UK, Ireland and Europe</b> <b>Dr Mary Synge</b>	163